



**English Language Arts
Grade 3
Fall 2005**

**Response to the
Paired Reading Selections
Released Item # 22
Scoring Guide**



1B: RESPONSE TO THE PAIRED READING SELECTIONS

DIRECTIONS:

Think about *both* of the selections in Part 1A as you answer the following question. You may look back at the selections as often as needed.

22 Do you think Eric would want a porcupine as a pet?

Explain your answer using specific details and examples from *both* "Eric's Lizard" and "Porcupine." Be sure to show how the two selections are alike or connected.

Use the checklist on the next page to help you with your response.

Your response must be written in the lined spaces on page 15 and 16. Only the writing on the two lined pages will be scored. No additional sheets may be used.

You may not use any resource materials (dictionaries, grammar books, spelling books, etc.) for any part of this test.

**PART 1B: CHECKLIST FOR THE
RESPONSE TO THE PAIRED READING SELECTIONS**

DIRECTIONS:

Use this checklist to help you with your response. Your response must be written in the lined spaces on pages 15 and 16.

CHECKLIST:

- _____ Do I take a position and clearly answer the question I was asked?
- _____ Do I support my answer with specific examples and details from *both* reading selections?
- _____ Do I show how the two reading selections are alike or connected?
- _____ Is my response complete?

Michigan Educational Assessment Program Rubric for the Response to the Paired Reading Selections Grades 3–8

Here is an explanation of what scorers think about as they score this writing:

- 6** The student clearly and effectively chooses key or important ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a clear connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are thoroughly developed with appropriate examples and details. There are no misconceptions about the reading selections. There are strong relationships among ideas. Mastery of language use and writing conventions contributes to the effect of the response.
- 5** The student makes meaningful use of key ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a clear connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are well developed with appropriate examples and details. Minor misconceptions may be present. Relationships among ideas are clear. The language is controlled, and occasional lapses in writing conventions are hardly noticeable.
- 4** The student makes adequate use of ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are supported by examples and details. Minor misconceptions may be present. Language use is correct. Lapses in writing conventions are not distracting.
- 3** The student takes a clear position on the question. The response makes adequate use of ideas from one reading selection **or** partially successful use of ideas from both reading selections to support the position. The position is developed with limited use of examples and details. Misconceptions may indicate only a partial understanding of the reading. Language use is correct but limited. Incomplete mastery over writing conventions may interfere with meaning some of the time.
- 2** The student takes a clear position on the question. There is partially successful use of ideas from one reading selection **or** minimal use of ideas from both reading selections to support the position. The position is underdeveloped. Major misconceptions may indicate minimal understanding of the reading. Limited mastery over writing conventions may make the writing difficult to understand.
- 1** The student takes a position on the question but only makes minimal use of ideas from one reading selection **or** the student attempts to support an unclear position with minimal use of ideas from both reading selections. Ideas are not developed and may be unclear. Major misconceptions may indicate a lack of understanding of the reading. Lack of mastery over writing conventions may make the writing difficult to understand.

Condition codes for unratable papers (zeroes):

A – Off Topic

B – Written in a Language other than English or Illegible

C – Blank or Refusal to Respond

D – Retells or references the reading selections with no connection to the scenario question or theme

E – Responds to the scenario question with no reference to either of the reading selections

Anchor Paper 1—Score Point D

Eric like to watch little lizards that lived around his house. the lizards were brown every kind of brown. Sometimes they were the brown of chocolate cake or the brown of sand in a sandbox. they could change to every brown in between can't you decide what color want to be? Eric asked the lizards. During the they sat in the sun. Sometimes they stuck out the red skin on their throats and nodded their heads up and down like little flags. are you saying something to each other Eric asked.

Anchor Paper 1—Score Point D

In this response, the student merely retells the beginning of "Eric's Lizard," without taking a position or connecting any of the detail to the question that was asked. This is not a creditable response.

Anchor Paper 2—Score Point E

I think that Eric would like to have a
lizard insted of a porkipine.

Anchor Paper 2—Score Point E

The student takes a position [Yes] but fails to provide any support or make a connection between the two reading selections. There is no evidence that the student read either selection, making this a non-creditable response.

Anchor Paper 3—Score Point 1

No, because
Eric might not like porky pines
as much as he likes lizzards.
By the way I think the
Lizzards can get hurt.

Anchor Paper 3—Score Point 1

The student takes a position (*No*) and clearly references one reading selection, “Eric’s Lizard” (...because *Eric might not like porky pines as much as he likes lizzards*). Although the reference is underdeveloped, it is evidence of having read the selection and therefore it minimally supports the position. The second sentence is too vague to give any credit. There is no connection between the reading selections.

Anchor Paper 4—Score Point 1

I think he would have a liserd
becus Porky Pines are to danjris
But if you had to have One I Sill
wouldnt have One. But he would he
would have a liserd.

Anchor Paper 4—Score Point 1

The student takes a position [No] and supports it with a minimal idea from one reading selection, "Porcupine" (...becus Porky Pines are to danjris). Although the student does not provide any specific text details, the student's observation that the porcupine is dangerous is a reasonable interpretation drawn from the poem. The student mentions 'liserd' but does not provide details from the story. There is no connection between the reading selections.

Anchor Paper 5—Score Point 1

He would not have a porcupin as a pet
because it has quills and if someone
makes noise then it's going to get
mad.

Anchor Paper 5—Score Point 1

The student takes a position [No] and supports it with minimal details from one reading selection, "Porcupine" (...because it has quills and if someone makes noise then it's going to get mad). There is no reference to the other reading selection and no connection between the articles.

Anchor Paper 6—Score Point 2

I don't think Eric would really
would want a porcupine as a pet
because quills go in very fast and
if Eric tries to pet his porcupine
a quill will go inside of Eric's fingers
and never come out. I'm really
sure Eric would not want a pet
that would hurt him every time he
touched it.

Anchor Paper 6—Score Point 2

The student takes a position [No] and supports it with partially successful use of ideas, from one reading selection, "Porcupine" (...because quills go in very fast...a quill will go inside of Eric's fingers and never come out...Eric would not want a pet that would hurt him). The student neither references the other selection nor provides a connection between the two articles.

Anchor Paper 7—Score Point 2

No, ERIC wold not like a PORCUPINE
Because thay have quills thay are
poky. He wold like a lizerd because Eric
wold go and visit the lizerds evrry
day.

Anchor Paper 7—Score Point 2

The student takes a position (No, Eric wuld not like a porcupine) and supports it with a minimal detail from each text (wold not like a porcupine because they have quills are poky...Eric wold go and visit the lizards evrry day). Beyond taking a position on the question, no connection is made between the two texts.

Anchor Paper 8—Score Point 2

Eric Would NOT Want a porcupine becuse
it Would poke him.
he Would WANT a lizard becuse
lizards are Cool becuse they change
Colors

Anchor Paper 8—Score Point 2

The student takes a position and supports it with a minimal detail from each selection (Eric would not want a porcupine because it would poke him. he would want a lizard because lizards are cool because they change colors.) Beyond taking a position on the question, no connection is made between the two texts.

Anchor Paper 9—Score Point 3

NO I do not think ERIC will
like a porcpine as a pet
because it can poke you.
And it might get mad.
The porcpine and the lizard
are boath animals.

Anchor Paper 9—Score Point 3

The student takes a position (*No*) and supports it with a reference from one reading selection, "Porcupine" (...*it can poke you. And it might get mad*). The other article is only referenced by the clear connection provided between the selections (*The porcpine and the lizard are boath animals*). This response moves to a score of 3 because it has a valid connection across the two texts, but only has support for the position from one text.

Anchor Paper 10—Score Point 3

I think Eric wouldn't want a porcupine for a pet. Eric like his lizard better because he took care of it and it could change colors. He likes to watch it. The lizard is a better pet then the porcupine because lizards are safe. The porcupine would sting Eric. Eric wouldn't want a pet that stings him. That is why I think that Eric wouldn't want a porcupine as a pet.

Anchor Paper 10—Score Point 3

The student takes a position [No] and supports it with partially successful use of ideas, mainly from one reading selection, "Eric's Lizard" (*Eric like his lizard better because he took care of it and it could change colors. He likes to watch it*). The student also makes reference to the other selection, "Porcupine," with a minimal idea. (*The porcupine would sting Eric*). There is no connection between the selections.

Anchor Paper 11—Score Point 4

No I think Eric doesn't want a porcupine because
lizards change colors, lizards drink dew off leaves.
I don't think Eric wants a porcupine for a pet
because a porcupine has squills and spike they'll make you pout
These stories are alike because they have animals.
That's why I said no.

Anchor Paper 11—Score Point 4

The student takes a position (No) and supports it with details from both reading selections, "Eric's Lizard" (...because lizards change colors, lizards drink dew off leaves) and "Porcupine" (...a porcupine has squills and spike they'll make you pout). The student also provides a clear, basic connection between the selections (These story's are alike because they have animals). Although the response contains all the elements (position, support from both texts, connection) required for a "4," it is a low "4" because it only briefly addresses each selection.

Anchor Paper 12—Score Point 4

I think Eric would hate to have a wild porcupine as a house pet. Porcupines have a lot of very sharp spikes on it's back and they are thin and long they hurt a lot infact they hurt so bad they will make you pout. They go in quick and they won't come out that easily. But lizards are kind soft and very gentle. They don't have spikes like a porcupine does so they don't hurt. You can play with them and they can change in to any color that they are surrounded by. So if you where looking for a pet I would choose a lizzard. In the story Eric's lizard he found a lizard that he wanted as a pet and that is why I said a lizard is a good kind of

pet. In Porcupine it said a porcupine
is an animal to stay away from.

Anchor Paper 12—Score Point 4

The student takes a position [No] and makes adequate use of ideas from both selections, "Porcupine" (*Porcupine's have a lot of very sharp spikes...they hurt a lot in fact they hurt so bad they will make you pout. They go in quick and they won't come out that easily*) and "Eric's Lizard" (*But lizards are kind soft and very gentle...so they don't hurt...you can play with them and they can change in to any color that they are surrounded by*). The student makes a connection between the two texts through the use of a contrast: porcupines hurt and lizards don't.

Anchor Paper 13—Score Point 4

Yes I think Erik would like a pet porcupine because In the poem "porcupine" the said be gentle and plesant with porcupines so in The story Erik's Lizard he was gentle and plesant with the lizard. This supports my answer because I think Erik could take great care of the porcupine and the quill's will not come out and hurt Erik because the porcupine only uses them when he is in a bad mood. And Erik is very nice to the lizard and he would be nicer to the porcupine. Erik does not want to get hurt.

Anchor Paper 13—Score Point 4

The student takes a position (Yes) and supports it with adequate details from both reading selections. There is a connection between the selections (...because In the poem "porcupine" the said be gentle and plesant...in the story Erik's Lizard he was gentle and plesant...Erik is very nice to the lizard and he would be nicer to the porcupine). Although the student does not specifically state these are the connections, the parallel ideas used for both selections make valid and clear connections. The details provided in the response support the position and the connection.

Anchor Paper 14—Score Point 5

No, I don't think Eric would want a pet porcupine. He probably wouldn't want one because porcupines have sharp quills that can go into your skin and hurt you.

In the first story, Pet Lizzard Eric has a bunch of lizzards in his yard. One day he asked his parents if he could keep one as a pet. His parents said "Yes." So he finally caught a lizzard to keep. But unlike the wild lizzards this lizzard didn't do anything. So Eric finally let it go. Eric probably wouldn't want a wild animal as a pet.

In the second story, Porcupine it talks about how porcupines can hurt you with their sharp thin quills.

And sometimes they get stuck and you can't get them out! I really don't think Eric wants a pet porcupine.

In both selections, Eric's Pet Lizzard and Porcupine they both show that a wild animal isn't a good pet. The animal might miss its home and do nothing. But a porcupine might hurt you with quills. So Eric might not want to have a pet porcupine.

Anchor Paper 14—Score Point 5

The student takes a position (No) and supports it by making meaningful use of key ideas from the two selections, "Eric's Lizzard" (Eric has a bunch of lizzards in his yard...But unlike the wild lizzards this lizzard didn't do anything. So Eric finally let it go) and "Porcupine" (...porcupines can hurt you with their sharp thin quills. And sometimes the get stuck). The student also provides a clear connection between the selections (...they both show that a wild animal isn't a good pet).

Anchor Paper 15—Score Point 6

No. No, I do not think Eric would want a pet porcupine. I think this because a porcupine is just like a lizard, a wild animal.

In the first story, Eric's Lizard he caught a wild lizard and made it his pet. That night Eric let the lizard go free because the lizard could not do what a wild lizard do in a cage. So if Eric didn't want a wild animal then what makes you think he will want one now?

In the 2nd story or poem, Porcupine it said a lot of things a person would not like to happen to them. Like, "He has quills, these long thin spikes that no one but a porcupine likes. He'll use them when

he's in a mood. Like when your
loud or mean or rude." Porcupines are
wild animals too.

Eric would not like to
take wildness away from another
animal. That is why I do not
think Eric would like a porcupine
as a pet.

These stories are alike because
they both tell people that you should
not take a wild animal and say it
is your pet.

Anchor Paper 15—Score Point 6

The student takes a position (No) and effectively supports it with key ideas from both "Eric's Lizard" (...he caught a wild lizard and made it his pet...Eric let the lizard go free because the lizard could not do what a wild lizard do in a cage) and "Porcupine" ([a porcupine]...has quill, these long thin spikes...He'll use them when he's in a mood...Porcupines are wild animals too. Eric would not like to take wildness away from another animal). The response is succinctly written, clearly developed and insightful. The student also provides a clear connection between the selections (...both tell people that you should not take a wild animal and say it is your pet).